

Book Reviews

Ralph Dekoninck, Pierre-Antoine Fabre, and Walter S. Melion, eds, « *Je révisé les images...* ». *Genèse, structure et postérité des Evangelicae historiae imagines de Jerónimo Nadal*, Rome: École française de Rome, 2023. 625pp. € 38. ISBN 9789332868618.

È stato pubblicato a Roma per la collana dell'École française un volume di ben 625 pagine dedicato interamente ad un antico libro di grande formato, corredato da centinaia di incisioni a bulino raffiguranti episodi dei Vangeli, commentati dal gesuita Jerónimo Nadal e pubblicato alla fine del Cinquecento. Si tratta di un progetto di ricerca con una lunga gestazione, curato da Ralph Dekoninck, Pierre-Antoine Fabre e Walter S. Melion, studiosi ben accreditati in questo campo da molti anni. Sono stati raccolti 18 contributi suddivisi in tre parti, secondo quanto si può leggere già nel titolo: "*Genèse, structure et postérité*". Fabre ha scritto un contributo per ciascuna parte, essendo giustamente un veterano degli studi su Nadal, attraverso una lettura spirituale e filosofica, che si è andata affinando nel tempo.

Per chi non conoscesse le *Evangelicae historiae imagines* di Nadal può sembrare eccessivo dedicare tutto questo sforzo intellettuale ad un solo libro. Invece, quando ci si accosta alla bellezza delle incisioni e al relativo testo di commento, si comprende che si tratta di uno dei più importanti libri non solo della storia dell'editoria della Compagnia di Gesù, ma anche del Cinquecento in generale. Sono trascorsi ben circa trent'anni dalla mia recensione (*AHSI* 66,1997) al primo saggio critico (1995) su questo argomento scritto dal padre pallottino Paul Rheinbay e veramente sorprende come in questo lungo periodo l'interesse verso certi temi sull'uso dell'immagine cristiana nella Compagnia di Gesù si sia diffuso in modo esponenziale. Perciò l'attuale pubblicazione di questa ponderosa ricerca, dove sono stati approfonditi i tanti aspetti che riguardano il libro di Nadal, costituisce certamente un notevole avanzamento degli studi. Ciascun contributo risulta di grande interesse, perché fornisce indicazioni e rifles-

sioni che riescono a comporre un discorso critico, che arricchisce gli studi su tale argomento.

La storia delle *Evangelicae*, infatti, è molto complessa e complicata, perché non riguarda solo la figura del suo autore Nadal, ma anche la storia della Compagnia degli anni successivi, in quanto il libro è stato pubblicato postumo. Il progetto, iniziato a Roma, non segue un percorso lineare ma si sposta per l'Europa, approdando definitivamente ad Anversa, roccaforte cattolica dei gesuiti ai confini delle terre protestanti e centro strategico di creazione e diffusione di immagini a stampa a carattere spirituale.

Nella prima parte della ricerca, *Les images de Nadal*, nei contributi di Guiderdoni, Dekoninck, Fabre, Melion, Franceschini, Vacalebre, Bowen e Imhof si sottolinea il ruolo dell'immagine nella spiritualità dei gesuiti e si analizza come la ricca serie di illustrazioni costituita da 153 incisioni a bulino, abbia contribuito a rafforzare l'importanza figurativa nella preghiera. Si ricorda che è stato lo stesso Ignazio di Loyola a fornire a a Nadal l'indicazione di elaborare delle immagini da affiancare le meditazioni degli scolastici gesuiti, che si stavano preparando alla vita sacerdotale. Non bisogna mai dimenticare, infatti, che le incisioni di Nadal sono state pensate non a esclusivo fine meditativo personale, ma innanzitutto per far preparare bene le omelie ai sacerdoti durante la messa domenicale. Le illustrazioni sono state concepite fin dall'inizio seguendo rigorosamente l'ordine del calendario liturgico, come si vede chiaramente dai numeri in alto ai fogli incisi e prima ancora nei disegni preparatori. Inoltre all'interno di ogni illustrazione ci sono delle lettere che richiamano il corrispondente brano evangelico, scritto nel basso di ciascun foglio. È un sistema mnemonico che serviva a fissare nella mente le singole scene o concetti dell'episodio raffigurati che contestualmente Nadal approfondisce in varie pagine di commento. In seguito, durante la lunga fase di gestazione, quando si cercavano degli ulteriori finanziamenti per poter compiere una degna pubblicazione, venivano evidenziate anche le finalità missionarie e catechetiche riposte in queste immagini e che potevano essere usate da "altre persone principali dell'Indie nuovamente convertite alla nostra santa fede". Immagini, quindi, non solo destinate a "persone contemplative", ma "ai quei nuovi christiani" per "poter con più facilità imprimere ... tutti gli misterii della redentione humana, quali per via di predicatione et catechismo difficilmente ritengono" (50).

Questa dimensione ad uso liturgico e catechetico delle immagini, concepita in modo pratico, presenta delle caratteristiche specifiche,

che prendendo le mosse da quella più eminentemente contemplativa, legata alla prassi meditativa della preghiera gesuitica, formulata da Ignazio negli *Esercizi Spirituali*, sbocca verso intendimenti spirituali programmatici. Certe sottili distinzioni sono indispensabili ai fini della comprensione dell'immagine/arte cristiana, perché uno stesso soggetto evangelico può essere espresso in modi differenti, a seconda della motivazione e del fine a cui si riferisce (pala d'altare, immagine di devozione privata, catechesi, e così via). I gesuiti erano consapevoli di questo, in quanto il successore di Ignazio, il teologo Diego Laínez, partecipò in prima persona alla stesura del decreto sulle immagini sacre nel Concilio di Trento (1563), dove in sintesi viene riconfermata la definizione teologica dell'immagine. Le *Evangelicae* si collocano esattamente in quest'epoca della storia della Chiesa, dove la funzione dell'arte sacra viene ribadita e riattualizzata.

Nella seconda parte, *Genèse*, i contributi di De Boer, Fabre, Boubi, Breccia Fratadocchi e Melion affrontano il lungo percorso editoriale. Le differenti soluzioni iconografiche che accompagnano la genesi delle illustrazioni delle *Evangelicae* testimoniano del lungo passaggio di cambiamenti compositivi che sono avvenuti dall'inizio del progetto fino all'anno della prima pubblicazione, nel 1593. Sono differenze sostanziali, perché riguardano tempi decisamente lenti: dall'intuizione iniziale di Ignazio, alla difficile elaborazione, ad opera di Nadal, del rapporto parola sacra/Vangelo con una forma concreta di immagine (Melion), passando attraverso la speciale comprensione di Francesco Borgia dell'importanza strategica dell'uso di immagini da meditare, fino alle successive difficoltà, morto nel 1580 Nadal (1580), nel portare avanti il progetto, che si protrasse, infatti, fino agli anni del generalato di Claudio Acquaviva.

Fondamentale diventa anche in questa "tormentata" storia del libro il ruolo degli artisti, ossia di coloro che sono stati il tramite attivo delle indicazioni teoriche di Nadal prima e dei suoi successori poi. Nonostante dispiaccia la mancanza di un approfondimento attributivo dei primi disegni preparatori romani – impeccabile, invece, l'analisi codicologica (Breccia Fratadocchi) del corpus grafico – certamente ricche di considerazioni sono le pagine (Dekoninck) sul confronto iconografico di tali disegni con le varianti apportate da Bernardino Passeri, e sulle incisioni finali dei fratelli Wierix e degli altri artisti fiamminghi.

Nella terza parte, *Postérité*, i contributi di Massing, Fabre, Zierholz, Shin, Morishita, Saint-Martin servono a rimarcare come le illustra-

zioni delle *Evangelicae* hanno continuato a vivere, venendo riattualizzate per diverse occasioni. Di particolare interesse ad esempio è il progetto editoriale del gesuita Bartolomeo Ricci (Zierholz); la storia delle xilografie con la figura della Vergine con i tratti orientalizzati per fini missionari in Cina (Shin); oppure l'edizione francese di grande formato nello scorcio dell'Ottocento (Saint-Martin).

Il libro è ben curato editorialmente: ciascun contributo ha all'interno le proprie illustrazioni di riferimento; inoltre è stata inserita anche un'ampia scelta delle incisioni delle *Evangelicae*, tratte dall'edizione definitiva del 1593. Sarebbero stati utili, però, degli apparati sinottici in ordine cronologico con le varie tappe della genesi del libro, dei disegni, delle incisioni e delle varie edizioni, come anche l'elenco alla fine in ordine alfabetico della bibliografia completa, essenziale e pratica per un testo scientifico così importante.

Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Rome Lydia Salviucci Insolera

Birgit Emich, Daniel Sidler, Samuel Weber, and Christian Windler, eds, *Making Saints in a "Glocal" Religion: Practices of Holiness in Early Modern Catholicism*, Cologne: Böhlau, 2024. 514pp. €95. ISBN 978-3-412-52979-6; ISBN-e 978-3-412-52980-2.

This edited volume is the sum of an international workshop convened in October 2021 on the topic of early modern Catholic sainthood. The essays focus especially on the seventeenth century, delineating the changes to canonizations before and after the reforms of Pope Urban VIII (r. 1623–44). The process became increasingly formalized after the shifting sands of the initial decades of the Congregation of Sacred Rites, founded in 1588 to assess candidates for sainthood. The subsequent reframing of canonizations by Pope Benedict XIV (r. 1740–58) is incorporated into the discussion as well. The introduction, conclusion, fourteen essays, and three comment pieces assemble a group of North American and European scholars allowing for impressive analytic depth achieved through thematic and chronological breadth. The comments that bookend each of the book's three sections are especially helpful at synthesizing disparate and diverse essays as is the introduction, which is a substantive overview adeptly weaving together several historiographies. The three sections cover the production, the interpretation, and dissem-

ination of sainthood. The book's bibliography alone is worth the price of admission.

The first section on the production of sanctity is ambitious through its integration of disparate eras and places. Birgit Emich and Maria Teresa Fattori focus on the Roman aspects of canonization. The former does so through the involvement of cardinal-nephews in successful causes as seen in her consideration of the Ludovisi and Borg-hese families' role in the determination of saints. Though the official process mattered, kinship networks also played a significant role in the transformation of candidates into saints. Fattori maps out the technical and historical development of canonization procedure at the hands of Benedict XIV prior to and during his pontificate. The remaining essays further our understanding by bringing local definitions into the universal church: Alexandra Walsham through a close reading of a Welsh recusant martyr, Daniel Sidler's examination of little-known Swiss holy persons, and the series of five case-studies by Marie-Élizabeth Ducreux that elucidates various cults from Central Europe. While familial relations mattered, political and religious leadership were paramount to the promulgation of sainthood whether official or not. Readers gain insight about the social and intellectual dimensions of canonizations in Rome during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries thanks to Emich and Fattori, whereas Walsham, Sidler, and Ducreux amplifies our knowledge through persons, devotions, and causes largely overlooked in the field. Barbara Stollberg-Rillinger's concluding statement challenge the reader to think through the ramifications of the formalization of canonization both in Rome and in local contexts.

Although dubbed as the framing of sanctity, the book's second part could be envisioned as an analytical cluster of cults in the Spanish Monarchy, a notion reinforced obliquely in Christian Windler's summation. The studies of two Johns – of the Cross and of God – by Jodi Bilinkoff and Cécile Vincent-Cassy track how participants of new religious institutes envisioned their luminaries. John of the Cross was integral to the creation of the Discalced Carmelites with Teresa of Ávila in Spain during the second half of the sixteenth century. The followers of John of God assembled the Brothers Hospitallers after his death in 1550. While John of God became a saint first, the reader can see commonalities between the efforts to canonize founders of religious orders: Ignatius of Loyola and Teresa being notable examples. The recognition of John of God as a saint in 1690 alongside four others is reminiscent of the quintet of canonizations

that occurred in 1622 and again in 1671. On all three occasions, saints from the Spanish Monarchy – and their sustained support – outnumbered other places of origin. The two remaining contributions help to reorient scholars about Spanish causes, first is the study by Andreea Badea of María de Jesús de Ágreda, a correspondent of King Philip IV of Spain (r. 1621–65), writer of mystical treatises, and a Franciscan abbess. She had a reputation of bilocation between her monastery in the northern Iberian Peninsula and the northern reaches of the Viceroyalty of New Spain. Through a lesser-known figure, readers learn how the distance between Madrid and its overseas territories was reduced by such spiritual measures. Moreover, she was subject to examination by the Inquisition, reminding scholars of the fine line between saintliness and heresy, a topic revisited by Simon Ditchfield in his essay. María's cause is still ongoing, whereas Carlo Borromeo became a saint in 1610. As argued by Samuel Weber in his essay, Borromeo was the Archbishop of Milan, which was under Spanish Habsburg rule between 1556 and 1707. The implications of that connection have not been adequately unpacked until now. Family connections were integral, but so too was the support of monarchs, who claimed candidates as their subjects. The Spanish Monarchy, as this section conveyed, predominated canonization efforts during the seventeenth century.

The third and final section investigates the dispersal of sanctity starting in Rome with the contributions by Simon Ditchfield and Christophe Duhamelle. Ditchfield supplies the readers about the functioning of the Holy Office, the adjudicators of heresy and sanctity alike, during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. We encounter Benedict XIV again, who is the capstone of Ditchfield's claim about the need to consider the Holy Office along with the Congregation of Sacred Rites when examining cultic devotions. Duhamelle, meanwhile, reminds the reader of the importance of the rediscovery of the relics of martyrs in the Roman catacombs and the decision to disseminate them across the world. But how did this manifest in different contexts? Philipp Zwyssig starts with a look at the cult of Jesuit Luigi Gonzaga in the Valtelline of northern Italy, a frontier Alpine valley and key pass to Switzerland and Germany, whereas Raphaële Preisinger considers the global circulation of representations of the Martyrs of Nagasaki – twenty-three Franciscans and three Jesuit-affiliates put to death in the Japanese port-city in 1597. Nadine Amsler finally explores saints' cults as they manifested in China within the early modern Jesuit mission. This scholarly trio remind us of the im-

portance of devotional objects to the dispersal of a cult through their extended case studies. These 'networks of persons and things', to use Zwyssig's coinage, installed and promulgated a holy person's reputation to be supplemented by miracles as he and Amsler argue convincingly. Images, as Preisinger reminds us, matter to determination of sainthood as do relics, which this section of the book reiterates at length. Duhamelle and Zwyssig both repeat the importance of kin networks to the expansion of cults as contended in other essays in this book, such as those by Emich and Weber.

Researchers of the Society of Jesus are given insight into the structures and procedures at play in the causes for its earliest saints, including Ignatius, Francis Xavier, and Gonzaga. While the 1622 canonizations of Loyola and Xavier get regular, albeit passing, mention, Emich's assessment of the Jesuit-educated Ludovisi as significant agents in these processes is notable. A special treat is Zwyssig's essay on the cult of Gonzaga on which additional research is in dire need. Amsler, meanwhile, grounds her analysis in the Society's mission in China and the global cult of Ignatius. One oversight left by this book on the matter of Jesuit studies is the role of procurators and postulators in causes of canonization, who supply the administrative mobilization for the process to proceed. Virgilio Cepari is well-known for his involvement in the causes of Maria Maddalena de' Pazzi and different Jesuits as examined in the work of Clare Copeland and Franco Motta. The scholarship on these agents, while ever growing, must also better account for these agents in canonizations. More is required apart from Emich's brief reference in her contribution (80). Ditchfield does something of the sort, although for Antonio Gallonio of the Oratorians (322–28).

The book is invaluable to the study of saints, sanctity, and sainthood in the broadest sense and in any subsequent examination of post-Tridentine Catholicism as a world religion. Markus Friedrich's comment is a helpful distillation of the field and ways for its advance. Another route recommended by this reviewer is to consider a glaring lacuna in this book, namely the Viceroyalty of Peru and the saint-making machine in operation since the mid-seventeenth century. The cause of Rose of Lima, who gets repeated references throughout this book, is only the summit of a large number of causes operating simultaneously out of Lima. The contributors provide suggestive ruminations through the categories of global, local, universal, particular, and polycentric when interpreting early modern religious cultures with Emich attempting to reconcile these threads

in the book's conclusion. The reviewer, however, is left wondering the extent to which Catholicism is 'glocal', 'universacular', or some combination therein. Beyond this difficulty and the criticisms enumerated previously, this reviewer is univocal in praising this tome for grappling with the conceptual and geographical expanse that was sainthood in the early modern Catholic world.

Vanier (Canada)

Jonathan Greenwood

Barton T. Geger SJ, ed., *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus: A Critical Edition with the Complementary Norms*, Boston: Institute of Advanced Jesuit Studies, 2024. 624pp. €46. ISBN 9781947617216.

Barton T. Geger is an eminent scholar in Ignatian Spirituality and an expert in the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus. Besides the current critical edition on the Constitutions, he has worked on primary sources of Ignatian Spirituality such as translating the Autograph Copy of the Spiritual Exercises and providing a new introduction to the revised edition of 'The Pilgrim's Testament.' He has various researched articles explaining important insights, clarifying concepts and debunking myths related to Ignatian Spirituality. His Doctorate from the University of Comillas, Spain in 2010 was titled *To Live and Die in the Society of Jesus: The Idea of Perseverance in the Jesuit Constitutions on the Jesuit Constitutions*. Given his research and expertise, there is no doubt he is well equipped to offer a comprehensive and critical edition of the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus.

The Second Vatican Council, in the decree *Perfectae Caritatis*, invited all religious orders towards a "constant return... to the original spirit of the institutes and their adaptation to the changed conditions of our time" (PC 2). In keeping with this invitation, translations of the Society of Jesus' Constitutions were published in different languages. Within the English language, an important translation was by George Ganss SJ in the year 1970. This translation of Ganss, included an introduction to the life-giving spirit within the Constitutions, the text proper and reference matter. The text proper began with the Formula of the Institute of 1550, followed by the Constitutions. It contained excellent footnotes and corresponding cross references. This edition offered technical explanation of various terms and was a reference book in English for anyone who desired to have

an in-depth understanding of the Constitutions. A second book in this series was edited by John W. Padberg SJ and published in the year 1996. Padberg focused on an edition which would include the Complementary Norms approved by the 34th General Congregation. The uniqueness of this book was that it placed the Formula of the Institutes of 1540 and 1550 side by side. In the same way, the original text of the Constitutions and the Complementary Norms were placed side by side. The footnotes of Padberg's edition were extensive and indicated texts which were explained, changed or abrogated. It contained various references to earlier General Congregations as well as documents pertaining to the Society of Jesus. After these two important works in English, we now have the current critical edition after a gap of 28 years. The author attempts to update the earlier work of Ganss and Padberg with current trends and offers an edition which can respond to the quest "not only of Jesuits, but also to their collaborators and friends, to other institutes in the Catholic Church that take their lead from Ignatius, and to every person who finds in Ignatius a compelling model of faith in action" (13). The current work can thus be situated within the Society of Jesus' efforts at responding to the call of the Second Vatican Council and the mandate received from recent General Congregations of the Society of Jesus.

The book begins with a preface explaining the origins of the current edition and its continuity with the work of Ganss. Furthermore, the author outlines the three-fold endeavour of this work to "explain the Constitutions in its historical context, identify the continuities and discontinuities with earlier religious institutes and highlight the coherence of the Society's charism as articulated by Ignatius" (5). After speaking about matters related to translation and the Complementary Norms, the preface addresses the question whether there is anything which could be called a classical Jesuit charism. The author affirms that Ignatius does "articulate a charism based on first principles; and this consists in 'dedicating oneself to serving the greater glory of God'" (5). The preface ends with an acknowledgement of various persons who have helped in preparing this critical edition and is followed by instructions on how to use the current edition.

An extensive introduction follows the preface, where the author indicates the need to have necessary resources to correctly interpret the spiritual doctrine of Ignatius. He contends that the Constitutions is not only for Jesuits, but it has something for all collaborators and

friends. Since the Society is not defined by a specific work, but by an ideal it lends itself to a wide variety of ministries which have as their end, the greater glory of God. This introduction points out that though there has been renewed interest in the primary sources of Ignatian Spirituality after the Second Vatican Council, interest in the Constitutions came about slowly and offers reasons for the same. The idea that Ignatius never desired to write the Constitutions and that the Constitutions are a dilution of the Spiritual Exercises are refuted by the author. Sources of Legislation and Content of the Constitutions which include the Examen, Declarations on the Examen, Constitutions and Declarations of the Constitutions are briefly explained. Further on the Preamble and Ten parts of the Constitutions are mentioned.

Like any other text, does the text of the Constitutions have semantic autonomy? This is a matter of debate and the author without getting into the intricacies of this issue, offers the reader three ways of interpreting the Constitutions: a) the historical-critical approach; b) experiential approach and c) rhetorical approach. The three approaches, their main proponents, important publications based on the said approaches and a critique of each is offered by the author. At the end of the three approaches, the author indicates that the "present edition of the Constitutions, the footnotes and appendices are intended primarily to assist with a historical-critical reading of the text" (41). The reasons for the same are elaborated. Towards the end of the introduction, the first principles leading to a charism which is "remarkably coherent, enduring and flexible" are explained. Towards the end of this section an explanation of the 'first principles' made up of four principles with their conclusion as well as additional conclusions are offered. All these reinforce the centrality of the first principles, i.e., 'the greater glory of God' within the text of the Constitutions.

The text of the Constitutions begins with the *Quinque Capitula* or 'The Five Chapters', the first draft of the Formula of the Institute prepared for the approval of the Holy See. This was prepared at the end of their Deliberations of 1539 and is a welcome addition to a book because it contains important facets of the emerging Society of Jesus - facets which would be incorporated into the Formula of the Institute. The Formula of the Institute of 1540 and 1550 are placed side by side in two columns as presented in the edition of Padberg. However, in this edition, there is a grey background, highlighting the text where there are major changes from its earlier ver-

sion. This helps the reader to quickly identify the text which has been modified in 1550. The author of this edition, moves away from the style of Padberg who placed the original text of the Constitutions and the Complementary Norms side by side for quick reference. This critical edition has separated the two and the Complementary Norms are placed after the text of the original Constitutions.

To my mind, a very important and valuable part of this book are the footnotes where the author has combined the extensive footnotes of Ganss and the references of Padberg. This is a major upgrade and the 761 footnotes of the Constitutions and 870 of the Complementary Norms are a veritable treasure trove of information about the Society original spirit, its charism, background, interpretation and actualization for today's world. While retaining the categories of Padberg regarding texts which have been explained, changed or abrogated, the author provides additional information about the changes introduced into the text. However, the depth of information goes way beyond the footnotes of Padberg's or Ganss' work. One finds in the footnotes various references to the MHSL, very specifically to the *Fontes Narrative, Constitutiones Societatis Jesu* and the *Epistolae et Instructiones*. Certain references to the Spiritual Diary, other foundational sources and regular explanations about Spanish words can be found. Various references to the early Jesuits are present throughout the text and prominent among them are Nadal, Laynez and Polanco. The Rules and Constitutions of other religious orders, the writings of their founders, their history and its resonance with the history of the Society of Jesus situate the Constitutions within the larger framework of religious life within the Church. References to scripture, to Papal Bulls, Church documents, to the early church Fathers, observations of the Roman Curia, the Code of Canon Law and eminent theologians such as Thomas Aquinas are found throughout the text. Besides references to the General Congregations, other documents of the Society of Jesus, pronouncements of various Superior Generals, the *Practica Quaedam, Acta Romana* and other documents of the Society of Jesus are interspersed throughout the book. Finally, it can be said that the author has incorporated modern scholarship on the Constitutions by quoting eminent experts in the Constitutions. These include works of experts from the English and Spanish languages as well as expert opinion from scholarly works of other languages. The author has been respectful towards persons critical of the Society of Jesus and hence we also find occasional footnotes of trenchant critics of the Society of Jesus.

The third part of this critical edition contains six appendices. The first appendix offers an elaborate explanation of various juridical texts within Catholic religious life and their application to texts within the Society of Jesus. Ten different texts are explained by the author and the footnotes offer further clarifications of the same. The second appendix dwells on the name of the Society, the objections raised against it, clarifications offered and finally Pope Gregory XIV's defence of this name. The third appendix is about the first principle for Ignatius, i.e., 'the Greater Glory of God' and its intimate link with the theme of the more universal good. The charism of service which is central to the Society's identity is well explained by dwelling upon Ignatius' personal journey, the evolution of the charism and its final expression with the Constitutions. The suspicion aroused by linking the Glory of God and the good of the Society, as well as explanations on this matter are clarified by the author. The fourth appendix is subdivided into eleven points and deals with the understanding of the Society of Jesus as a mystical body. The next appendix, i.e., the fifth, offers various points of clarification regarding grades in the Society of Jesus. The historical evolution of grades, controversies surrounding it and developments during the years subsequent to the Second Vatican Council are explained in this appendix. The sixth appendix is on discernment and the author begins by distinguishing discernment of spirits from the discernment of God's will. After briefly dwelling into the history of discernment, key concepts of discernment such as pure intention, indifference, *agere contra* and humility are elaborated. After the appendices, we have abbreviations, an annotated bibliography and finally an index of names and topics.

A detailed reading of this critical edition indicates that this as an excellent work. There is no doubt that the author has spent years preparing this edition and it will be a reference book on the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus in the English language for some time to come. In keeping with the original intention, this critical edition offers us a sound historical-critical perspective of the Constitutions in as objective a manner as possible and allows for multiple applications. Given the fact that the Society of Jesus is moving towards greater networking and collaboration, this edition is timely and is presented in a manner where one feels rooted in the foundational sources and is able to actualize the first principle of seeking the 'greater glory of God' by living it concretely in a variety of ways and situations. While the extensive introduction is scholarly, special mention needs to be made about the three methods of interpretation

and their critique. While some may have preferred a different hermeneutical key to interpret the Constitutions, the author has indicated his preference for the historical-critical method and has been faithful to it. The placement of the Complementary Norms after the text of Constitutions may be debated, especially after being accustomed to the presentation of Padberg. However, an equally important argument could be made that having the entire text without splitting it, allows a continuous reading and better assimilation of the intention of the author as well as the essence of the text.

Anyone familiar with the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus clearly understands the enormous significance of this critical edition and its universal impact. Hopefully a revised edition could be thought of at a later date where the theme of discerning love could be further explored, the theological foundations of the Constitutions may be developed and the inner spirit and dynamics as applicable for lay persons and groups could be considered. It is also hoped that a future edition could have additional appendices that include the Deliberations of 1539, the Constitutions of 1541 and the Spiritual Diary – foundational texts directly related to the Constitutions. These are possible additions to enhance and take forward what is already a brilliant work of rigorous scholarship. While many hands have worked towards this critical edition and all need to be felicitated, the editor needs to be specially congratulated for have placed in our hands a book which firmly roots the reader in the original spirit of the Constitutions and allows sufficient space for its application according to people, places and situations. All who desire to live by the Ignatian charism will find this book a wonderful resource for better understanding and living their vocation.

De Nobili College, Pune, India

Francis Pudhicherry SJ

Mauro Brunello and Michela Catto, *Ultimissime dalla Cina cavate da una relazione del 1602. Michele Ruggieri missionario e divulgatore*, Ostuni (Br): Calamospecchia, 2024. 245pp. €16. ISBN 979-1298516908.

Michele Ruggieri (Spinazzola, 1543–Naples, 1607) is often overlooked in the history of Christian (and Jesuit) missions in early modern China. Neither esteemed within his Jesuit order nor by later

scholars, he has long been sidelined. Many have criticized Ruggieri personally, questioned his methods of evangelization, and doubted his actual knowledge of Chinese language and culture. Mauro Brunello and Michela Catto aim to redress this scholarly gap, honoring this remarkable figure by dedicating their volume to him. This work includes a compelling and extensive introduction to Ruggieri's life as a Jesuit, as well as the publication of a previously unpublished Italian manuscript, made possible by support from Ruggieri's hometown, Spinazzola.

The book opens with a preface by Paolo de Troia (associate professor of Chinese Language, Literature, and Philology at Sapienza University of Rome), who describes Ruggieri as "the first true Western Sinologist" (12). This is followed by a thorough essay by the authors, which introduces Ruggieri's works in around one hundred pages. The volume closes with an afterword by Mimma Bruno, who laments Spinazzola's neglect of its distinguished son (by just naming a street and an underpass after him) and hopes for greater cultural initiatives in this regard, including a proposed twinning with Macerata, the birthplace of Matteo Ricci (1552–1610).

The section devoted to Ruggieri's life and works highlights the difference treatment between him and Ricci, whose every word has been meticulously published and studied. In contrast, Ruggieri's books and notes, some entirely unknown, remain unpublished. This is particularly the case for the handwritten manuscript, the centerpiece of this volume, recently rediscovered in ARSI after centuries of obscurity. It consists of a slightly adapted Italian translation of a 1692 report on China written by the Jesuit Diego de Pantoja (1571–1618). Unlike Ruggieri's work, Pantoja's report was quickly published in Spanish and subsequently translated into multiple languages, including Italian. Ruggieri encountered it in its Italian edition of 1607 and, in his final months, read, translated, and summarized it.

Ruggieri's life was marked by challenges and ambiguities. Born as "Pompilio" and not Michele, he lived as a layman for his first thirty years, obtaining a dual degree *in utroque iure* (i.e., canon and civil law) in Naples. He joined the Society of Jesus after several unsuccessful attempts – due to pending legal cases, as the fledgling Ignatian order was cautious about legal risks. Much about him, his family, and his relationships, particularly those with prominent figures of his time, can be gleaned from his 1570 will, published here in its entirety.

Ruggieri studied philosophy and theology at the Roman College. In 1577, he was assigned to the Eastern missions, although it is

unclear whether this was his choice or that of then-General Everard Mercurian (1514–80). Soon after, he departed, stopping in India before settling in Macao, where the visitor to the East Indies, Alessandro Valignano (1539–1606), ordered him to begin studying Chinese. Such an endeavor was not only innovative and difficult but nearly impossible, as there were no dictionaries, grammars, or formal teachers of the language at that precocious time. His persistent dedication to this task drew scorn from his companions, who saw his efforts as futile.

In 1580, Ruggieri received permission to reside in a small base in Guangzhou; two years later, he established a residence in Zhaoqing, joined by Francesco Pasio (1551–1612) and, later, Matteo Ricci. With the logistical foundations laid, theological considerations arose, such as how to translate the name of God. During this period, Ruggieri and Ricci began drafting a dictionary with Portuguese terms, corresponding Chinese characters, and pronunciation guides; they also translated Christian texts into Chinese with the help of local converts. However, Christianity struggled to gain traction, and the missionaries had to be mindful not to alienate local governors or the Jesuit hierarchy, who held varied views on their work.

After less than a decade in China, Ruggieri, now forty-five, was sent back to Europe by Valignano, who cited his age, his need for rest, and alleged inadequacies in learning the language for such a peculiar decision. Valignano's negative assessment of Ruggieri's linguistic abilities were possibly influenced by Ricci, since the visitor did not know Chinese at all. The official motivation was for Ruggieri to meet with the Pope in Rome, and plan an embassy to Beijing.

Upon returning to Europe, Ruggieri was warmly received at the courts of Lisbon and Madrid. In 1590, after a twenty-year absence, he returned to Naples, where he was welcomed by both Jesuits and surviving family members. Soon after, however, he was sent to Rome to engage with the curia about the planned embassy. Unfortunately, frequent changes in the papacy delayed this mission, and shifting political priorities in Spain further undermined progress.

Since his efforts with the Pope proved unfruitful, Ruggieri was assigned to various posts in Naples, Nola, and Salerno, often in modest offices such as prefect or spiritual advisor. Although these roles were below his capacity, they afforded him time for his true passion: translation. During these years, he transposed several Chinese texts into Latin, notably *I quattro libri* (*The Four Books*), which would have been the first European edition of Confucian texts. His abilities in

Chinese, though disparaged by Ricci and Valignano, appear sound. Yet when Valignano learned of these translations, he ordered Ruggieri to stop, promising that Ricci's forthcoming translations would be superior. In reality, Ricci never translated the Confucian texts, and Ruggieri's translations were lost and forgotten for centuries.

In 1601, Ruggieri was transferred from Salerno to Nola and then to Cosenza, where he held administrative and spiritual roles, though his increasingly isolated postings likely felt punitive and frustrating. Only in 1603 Ruggieri made his solemn profession – an unusually late milestone, aged sixty and after thirty years with the Jesuits. In 1605, he returned to Naples, a cultural hub where a missionary who had been to China attracted attention within and wide beyond the Jesuit circle. Prominent intellectuals such as Tommaso Campanella (1568–1639) and Giovanni Battista della Porta (1535–1615) sought his company. With della Porta's patronage and under his name, General Claudio Acquaviva (1543–1615) finally permitted the publication of Ruggieri's *Descrizione della Cina* (*Description of China*), a project he resumed enthusiastically, only to pass away in 1607.

As Brunello and Catto point out, "it is difficult to imagine what direction the [Chinese] mission might have taken without Ruggieri's fundamental contributions. What is certain is that Ricci's progress would have been slower, perhaps even impossible. Ruggieri's role in the mission and in knowledge transfer was not marginal but indeed crucial" (116). Nevertheless, while his works are nowadays being translated into Chinese, Ruggieri remains largely unknown in Europe, particularly in Italy.

Thus, this volume is a welcome addition to the field. Not simply a critical edition, it offers a substantial historical introduction authored by scholars who masterfully blend expertise in Jesuit archival sources (Mauro Brunello) and studies of the Jesuit missions in China (Michela Catto). Ruggieri's adaptation of de Pantoja's report is not merely a summary or translation; it reflects his editorial and stylistic choices, revealing what he considered relevant to European readers as knowledge of the Chinese empire which was becoming progressively more and more known. This volume not only contributes to our understanding of Jesuit and secular audiences but also offers a deeper insight into Ruggieri himself, shedding light on a figure whose legacy definitely deserves more recognition.

Daniel Canaris, ed., *Michele Ruggieri's Tianzhu shilu (The True Record of the Lord of Heaven, 1584)*, Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2023. 313pp. €129,47. ISBN 978-90-04-47014-9.

Michele Ruggieri was one of the first Western sinologists and a pivotal figure in the history of Sino-Western exchanges as well as in the spread of Christianity in China. Over the past two decades, significant research has been conducted on Ruggieri, especially at Sun Yat-sen University, under the leadership of Professor Thierry Meynard, and at Beijing Foreign Studies University, with contributions from Chinese and international scholars coordinated by Professor Zhang Xiping.

The text edited and translated by Daniel Canaris is particularly important for three reasons: it is a historical document representing one of the earliest attempts to adapt the Christian faith to Chinese cultural traditions. It is among the first Chinese texts authored by a foreigner, albeit with substantial assistance and support from local collaborators. It serves as a philosophical and catechetical text that demonstrates the Jesuits' dedication to spreading the Gospel, blending Scholastic theology with the Counter-Reformation's renewed focus on doctrinal clarity and inculturation.

Pompilio Ruggieri (later known as Michele) was born in Spinazola, Puglia, in Southern Italy, in 1543. He obtained a law degree in Naples and initially worked as a civil servant under King Philip II of Spain. In 1572, he experienced a calling to religious life and joined the Jesuits, where he was ordained a priest. In 1577, Ruggieri sailed from Lisbon to Goa, India, accompanied by Matteo Ricci, another young Jesuit. In 1578, Ruggieri continued to Macau, beginning his work in China.

In November 1584, Father Ruggieri published “天主實錄” (*The True Record of the Lord of Heaven*), the first written presentation of Catholicism in Chinese. At the time, Jesuits still referred to themselves as “bonzes” (a term borrowed from Buddhist clergy) and often used Buddhist terminology. In this catechism, Ruggieri described himself as a “bonze from India,” reflecting the Chinese practice of broadly referring to regions west of China as “India.”

Ruggieri's catechism presents Christianity to non-Christians, offering a concise yet apologetic summary of core Christian doctrines. The work's primary style is a question-and-answer dialogue, aimed at fostering intellectual engagement with Chinese cultural and philosophical traditions rather than directly proclaiming biblical

revelation. The dialogue is structured as an exchange between a Christian teacher and an inquiring scholar. For instance, in section 9.7, Ruggieri presents the Incarnation: “Why did the Lord of Heaven transforms himself into a man and suffer? Since people all over the world violate the commandments no one can atone for this sin. Therefore the Lord of Heaven was incarnated and descended into the world and suffered so that He could take away the sins of everybody and save their souls” (153). However, the catechism does not include a full exposition of the Creed. It omits significant articles of faith, such as the Holy Spirit, the Holy Catholic Church, the Communion of Saints, and the Resurrection of the flesh. Instead, it serves as an introductory conversation tailored to Chinese intellectuals interested in Christianity.

In 1588, Ruggieri’s Jesuit superior for Asia, Alessandro Valignano, summoned him back to Europe to organize a papal embassy to the Chinese emperor. In 1591, Ruggieri met Pope Gregory XIV, presenting a Latin version of his catechism, titled *Vera et brevis divinarum rerum exposition*. However, the Jesuit Superior General, Claudio Acquaviva, decided against sending Ruggieri back to China. He retired to Salerno and died in 1607, possibly in Naples.

The catechism achieved notable success. In 1585, the Provincial of Mexico reported to the Jesuit General in Rome that Alonso Sánchez of the Philippines had observed approximately 1,500 copies printed and distributed in Guangzhou. Matteo Ricci also noted that the book contributed to conversions, and Valignano suggested its use among Japanese Buddhist monks. In some of his letters Matteo Ricci exalts the merit of that first Catechism, but adds that the Provincial Fr. Valignano, has exhorted him to get acquainted with the *Four Books* (the main texts of Classical Chinese philosophy) to prepare a new catechism, since the previous one – the *The True Record of the Lord of Heaven* of Ruggieri– “non essere riuscito sí buono come avria d’essere” (“It was not as good as needed”). Valignano was encouraging the publication of a text more adapted to the Chinese context, therefore Ricci later revised the catechism, creating *The True Meaning of the Lord of Heaven* (天主實義), which was better tailored to Chinese culture and based on a deeper engagement with Chinese philosophy.

Nevertheless, Ruggieri’s catechism made a lasting impact, laying the groundwork for a Christian vocabulary in Chinese. Terms such as *Tianzhu* (God), *Chongai* (Grace), *Tiantang* (Heaven), and *Mogui* (Devil) became foundational. As Professor Canaris observes, these efforts were an early attempt to express Christian ideas in Chinese

by borrowing from Buddhist terminology or creating new words. Simple transliterations from Latin were also employed, such as *Pa-ti-shih-mo* for Baptism (*Baptismus*), *Ma-ti-li-mo-ni-yo* for Marriage (*Matrimonium*), and *Pei-ni-teng-chi-ya* for Confession (*Paenitentia*). Over time, these translations evolved, reflecting deeper integration into Chinese linguistic and cultural contexts.

Professor Canaris' edition of *The True Record of the Lord of Heaven* is a meticulously researched work, including a comprehensive introduction detailing Ruggieri's life and mission, a critical edition of the Chinese text alongside an English translation with extensive footnotes, the Latin catechism submitted for European censorship, an appendix containing *The True Record of the Holy Religion of the Lord of Heaven* (a later text edited after 1635 by Father Francisco Furtado), and a rich bibliography for further study. The translation aims to remain faithful to the original Chinese text while ensuring clarity and accessibility for modern English-speaking readers. The collaboration of scholars such as Wang Huiyu, Thierry Meynard, Wang Yuan, and Wang Qi has enriched this critical edition, making it an indispensable resource for the study of early Sino-Christian interactions and linguistic adaptation.

Beijing Foreign Studies University

Michele Ferrero

Helge Clausen, *Danske katolske konvertitter mellem reformationen og religionsfriheden: Med biografier af 266 danske konvertitter* [Danish Converts to Catholicism between the Reformation and Religious Emancipation 1536–1849: With biographies of 266 Danish Converts], Copenhagen: Katolsk Forlag, 2023. 325pp. DKK149.95. ISBN 978–87–92501–55–4.

This comprehensive study, written in Danish, comprises ten sections: 1) forward, 2) introduction, 3) historical background (124 pp.), 4) formation and education abroad (32 pp.), 5) Danish converts to the Catholic Church (short biographies, 181 pp.), 6) chronological register of converts, 7) quantitative analysis of the 266 converts, 8) comparison with the situations in Norway and England (6 pp.), 9) glossary, 10) sources and bibliography.

The author has chosen 1536 as the *terminus post quem* for the study, because in that year the Danish King Christian III deposed and im-

prisoned all the bishops in the realm, and then decreed that the office of bishop was from that time and forever completely abrogated in his kingdom. No bishop was resident in Denmark thereafter until 1892. The reformed Lutheran church was formally established and codified a year later with the promulgation of the *Kirkeordinans* [Church Ordinance] of 1537. Conversion to the Catholic Church was more or less illegal in Denmark until the ratification of the Danish constitution in 1849, which marks a *terminus ante quem*. The introduction and the chapter on historical background provide a clear overview of the peculiarities of the Protestant Reformation in Denmark and the establishment of the state church. The geographical limits of the study include, in addition to present-day Denmark, the now-Swedish provinces of Skåne, Halland, and Blekinge. This area of southern Sweden was traditionally Danish and was part of the Kingdom of Denmark until 1658. Also included are the Duchy of Holsten (Holstein), the Faroe Islands, Greenland, and the former Danish colonies in the West Indies, in present-day Ghana, and in India.

The heart of the book, as its title implies, are the biographies, averaging a page or so in length. They are supplied with detailed and up-to-date bibliographical references. While the Danish language might scare away some readers, the biographies are not so long as to hinder the use of an electronic translation program, and the bibliographical references include materials in English, German, and other less-familiar European languages. The book tells a story little known outside of Scandinavia — and not so well known within, either. It will be of interest to all historians of the Protestant Reformation, and not least to Jesuit historians.

The *Congregatio de Propaganda Fidei* was established in 1622, and the following year the congregation asked Flemish Province of the Jesuits to undertake a *Missio Danica* along with the Dominicans. Three Jesuits were missioned to Malmø (in Skåne, across the sound from Copenhagen), where they arrived in 1623. They attempted to work undercover, but by Christmas that year they were betrayed and forced to return home. The dramatic details of that brief but eventful undertaking await the reader. Denmark subsequently promulgated a law in 1624 that officially forbade Jesuits to enter the realm, and six months later Propaganda abandoned the mission. In their internal evaluation of the attempt, they were forced to acknowledge that undercover work in Denmark would be almost impossible, since there were no native Jesuits who could speak the language.

The influence of the Jesuits in those early years came instead through their colleges on the other side of the Baltic, many of which catered to Scandinavian students. In the period 1553–1622 there were 347 students from the newly-Protestant Nordic countries at the Jesuit schools in Braunsberg (Braniewo), Ölmütz (Olomouc), Vilnius, Graz, Prague, Augsburg, Cologne, Münster, Pułtusk, and Vienna, as well as at the Collegium Germanicum in Rome: 213 Swedes, eighty Danes, thirty-five Norwegians, eighteen Finns, and one Sami. None of them arrived as Catholics, and by no means did they all convert — but many did. The eighty Jesuit alumni make up a large proportion of the 266 Danish converts Clausen profiles. The college at Braunsberg was the most preferred: its location on the Vistula Lagoon in East Prussia made it the closest to Denmark. Fifty-one of Clausen's Danish converts studied there. Twenty-three were students at Ölmütz, seventeen at Vilnius, six at Graz, three at Cologne, three at the Germanicum, two at Münster, and one each at Prague, Augsburg, and Pułtusk. Clausen provides an overview of each of these institutions. Thirteen alumni entered the Society: three left or died as novices; the others all lived out their lives as Jesuit priests. None, however, returned to work in Denmark.

Not surprisingly for students with the means to study abroad, they came from prominent families. In a survey of their socio-economic backgrounds, Clausen can identify many of them. They include sons of the nobility, of Lutheran clergymen (the largest group), royal historians, a royal architect, royal cannon-makers, of mayors or guild deans (another large group), rectors of Latin schools, university faculty, and prominent merchants.

Seven converts from the pre-suppression schools later became Lutheran clergymen, seemingly without ever formally renouncing their Catholic faith. Most returned to Denmark. Sveder Poulsen Kitting, who was educated by the Jesuits at Braunsberg, became rector of the Latin school in Ålborg, where he was known as a proponent of the pedagogy of the *Ratio Studiorum*. He later took a position as pastor of a parish. Laurids Mogensen converted at Ölmütz where he appears to have been ordained a Catholic priest. He later returned to Denmark, and as he is documented as having been a guest-preacher in Norway, he must have been accepted as a Lutheran cleric. Laurids Clausen studied at Braunsberg, but later became professor in Copenhagen and then superintendent (the Lutheran administrative equivalent of a Catholic bishop) in Stavanger. Clausen refers to letters he wrote to Braunsberg in which he

describes himself as "Catholic at heart," and speaks of his plan to come to Braunsberg and make a general confession. According to Clausen, in Stavanger "he held a Catholic-friendly line, and did his best to avoid theology."

Despite the general suppression of the Catholic church within the borders of the realm, there were for economic and diplomatic reasons small enclaves of tolerance, and Jesuits were active in most them. The fishing village of Altona northwest of Hamburg had religious tolerance under a sympathetic count from 1594–1612, and again from 1658. Altona eventually grew to become a large commercial center, and under the pastoral care of Jesuits from Hamburg became an important base for the growth of the Church to the north. Nearby Glückstadt, on the north bank of the Elbe, likewise a center of international commerce, granted tolerance to Catholics from 1634 at the request of the Spanish ambassador. Jesuits served the Church there until about 1780, and many conversions were recorded. Another newly founded port city in the area was Frederiksstad (Friedrichstadt) in Schleswig. Catholics from the Netherlands and from Spain settled there. The town was initially served by the Dominicans, but they were replaced by Jesuits, who came in 1649 and were active until 1787.

The sites of greatest Catholic (and Jesuit) activity were Fredericia and Copenhagen. Following the end of the Thirty Years' War in 1648, Denmark established diplomatic relations with Spain. From that year the Spanish and French ambassadors were granted permission to hold Catholic services in the diplomatic chapels, which were served primarily by Jesuits. Only foreigners were permitted to participate, though at times tolerance was greater, and there are records indicating the involvement of Danes. The Jesuits' annual letters to their provincials note conversions, though these were normally not recorded in parish registers for fear of discovery and persecution. Fredericia, in Jutland, was founded in 1650 as a military base. Because of the many foreign mercenary soldiers and tradespeople, limited religious tolerance was granted to Catholics, Jews, Reformed Christians, and other banned groups. Fredericia was served exclusively by Jesuits (or former Jesuits, after the Suppression) until 1800.

In consideration of the audience of the journal, this review has focused on Helge Clausen's analysis of the role Jesuits played in Danish conversions to Catholicism in the period under consideration, but that is by no means the only story the book has to tell. The

period he delineates can be subdivided into the time before the suppression of the Society, when Jesuits dominated the scene, and the time after, where they were completely absent. Conversions in the post-Jesuit period were mostly well-to-do (and often prominent) Danes who met the Catholic Church on travels abroad. The book, primarily a work of original research and analysis, builds on the scholarship of earlier historians like Oskar Garstein and Vello Helk, and it is a good companion to the contemporary studies by Fredrik Heiding SJ, Magnus Nyman, Henning Laugerud, and others. It is packed with data and bibliography to be mined — all of which would be more accessible if it were provided with an index (my only quibble).

Fordham University

Martin Chase SJ

Emanuele Colombo and Paul Shore, *Jesuits and Islam in Europe*, Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2023. VIII+115pp. €89,88. ISBN 978-90-04-51731-8.

Jesuits and Islam in Europe is a synthesis of more than one decade of work by Emanuele Colombo and Paul Shore (d. 2023), two of the leading scholars in the history of the Jesuits and their relationships with Islam and Muslims. The book was published in open access in the Brill Research Perspectives in Jesuit Studies series edited by Robert Aleksander Maryks, and it aims to uncover the “underground river” of relations between Islam and the Society of Jesus in Europe from its foundation to its suppression. It shows how Muslims have been an Ignatius’ concern as is testified by his so-called autobiography where one can read the famous encounter he had with the Moor who offended the Virgin Mary provoking him anger.

The book correctly shows how the relationship between the Society of Jesus and Muslims has been complex. The Jesuits’ commitment to Islam developed on different levels, with ambivalent if not downright antithetical tendencies, sometimes coexisting in the same personality, as was the case with Ignatius of Loyola who, although he never completely abandoned the idea of a crusade against the infidels, was directly involved in setting up colleges in Messina and Monreale, plus a failed attempt in Malta, to also train missionaries ready to evangelise Muslims in North Africa. In this Ignatian project,

the study of the Arabic language by missionary candidates was of primary importance, as witnessed by Ignatius' desire to also let the Moriscos enter the Society because "some of them will be able to learn that language [Arabic] and will be able to help us in our mission in the Maghreb" (10). Also, in Antonio Possevino (1533–1611), as in the founder Ignatius, the attitude towards Islam oscillated between crusader nostalgia, the fight against the infidels and missionary commitment. Particularly in his famous *Bibliotheca selecta* (1593, 1603, 1607), Possevino does not hesitate to associate the Turks with the Lutherans and Calvinists, all responsible for the destruction of Europe.

The book also shed light on the Jesuit apostolate among Moriscos in the Iberian Peninsula and Muslims slaves in Spain and Italian port cities. The concern about the need-to-know Arabic for preaching to the Moriscos in the Iberian Peninsula was put in writing by Ignacio de Las Casas (1550–1608), a Jesuit of Moriscos origin promoter of the *evangelización suave* who was also one of the first Catholics to understand the theological importance of the Arabic and the not insignificant differences between the numerous Arabic dialects and the doctrinal language of the Qur'an. With regard to Muslim slaves, port cities such as Genoa, Livorno, Naples, and island like Malta were places where the Muslim presence was significant and interactions with the local Christian population, preachers and clergy were not sporadic. Naples in particular was home to a large and organised community of Muslim slaves who did not hesitate to make their voices heard for social rights. Here the Jesuits Girolamo d'Alessandro and Giacomo Antonio Giannoni (both dates unknown) founded the Congregation of the Epiphany with the aim of saving the souls of slaves from hell. For this reason, knowledge of languages was of primary importance in the apostolate experience among the Muslim slaves in Naples of some Jesuits, such as Pietro Antonio Spinelli, Mariano Manieri (both dates unknown) and Pietro Ferraguto (d.1656). Dialogues between Muslims and Catholic preachers such as those found in Ferraguto's work or even in the famous *Handbook to Convert Muslims* by the thirteenth Superior General of the Society of Jesus Tirso González de Santalla (1624–1705), where the Muslim does not convert, allow us to speculate that some of these encounters actually took place. The latter book in particular, although written by an author who did not know Arabic, encompasses the ambivalent Jesuit approach to Islam, which, in addition to the aforementioned fraternal dialogues between Muslims and

Christians, evokes the medieval conception of Islam as heresy.

A great merit of the book is that it devotes great attention to Jesuit scholarship in Oriental studies. To cite a few examples, it deals with the philological and proto-Orientalist attitude of Ignazio Lomellini (c.1560–1645) and Tomás de León (1613–90). Lomellini authored a never published edition of the Arabic text and Latin translation of the Qur'an with commentaries and marginalia in 1662 where he demonstrated a wide erudition ranging from Pagan, Hebrew, and Islamic authors. De León's Arabic interests were wide-ranging, from the curiosity he shared with Athanasius Kircher (1602–80) about arcane wisdom, to the importance of Arabic for the study of Spanish history, to his defense of Arabic as a means to spread the Christian faith. In all cases, he was aware of the need to study Islamic texts in their original linguistic context.

It can be said that the *fil rouge* of the book is the linguistic knowledge of the Jesuits. Although in some Jesuit works wholly or partly devoted to Islam and addressed to a wide European audience, such as Possevino's *Biliotheca* or *The Modern Prosperities of the Catholic Church against Muhammadanism* (1686) by Niccolò Maria Pallavicino (1621–92) or the aforementioned *Handbook* by Tirso Gonzalez are written by authors who did not know Arabic or other languages of the Muslim world, the authors of the book we are reviewing repeatedly emphasise the linguistic dimension of the Jesuit approach to Islam and Muslims. This linguistic dimension tended to merge with Ignatian spirituality in a synthesis masterfully represented by the unpublished *Apology for the Spiritual Exercises* (1554–56) by Jerónimo Nadal (1507–80). Here Nadal expounds his belief in the greater ease of converting Muslims rather than heretics and, probably referring to the eighteenth annotation of the *Spiritual Exercises* regarding how the *Excercises* should be adapted to the person who is receiving them, argues that: "Finally, we should communicate to them the way to make a good "election" according to their capacity to understand and their reason; if they follow the exercises in the correct way as we described before, if God wills, and if they do not deny the principles of the Christian faith, it does not seem difficult that the Muhammadans allow themselves to be persuaded, since they think that both our law and their Qur'an lead to salvation. ... When relying on a high truth, one cannot be mistaken" (12).

In conclusion, *Jesuits and Islam in Europe* is an important synthesis work on the relationship between the Society of Jesus and Islam in Europe in the early modern age, rich in information on this fasci-

nating topic. Not only a synthesis however, Colombo and Shore's book also offers important lines of research on which to develop future studies. In particular, that of language, which, following the track traced by Vincenzo Poggi and his important articles on Jesuit Arabism, sheds light on the importance of Arabic as a language used by the Jesuits both for preaching and for scholarly Orientalist studies. Future studies should therefore insist on this line of research by showing how knowledge of the Arabic language was fundamental in preaching practice towards Muslims, but also in the study and edition of Islamic texts. Moreover, Colombo and Shore's insistence on the linguistic datum will enable other scholars in the future to extend the field of research both chronologically, devoting in-depth attention also to the New Society and its missions in the Arab world, and in the linguistic spectrum, focusing on the languages of what has been called by the Italian Orientalist Francesco Gabrieli the "Islamic tripod": Arabic, Turkish and Persian. In particular, Persian was the vehicle for the transcontinental religious controversies initiated by the Jesuit Jeronimo Xavier (1549–1617) during his mission in Goa, which involved the Mughal emperors of India, the Shia theologians of Safavid Persia, members of various religious orders (Discalced Carmelites, Franciscans, Caracciokini), and eventually reached the translators and polemicists of Propaganda Fide in Rome.

Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Rome
Università di Napoli "L'Orientale"

Federico Stella

Mirosława Hanusiewicz-Lavallee, *The Call of Albion. Protestants, Jesuits, and British Literature in Poland-Lithuania 1567–1775*, Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2024. 468pp. €151,58. ISBN 978 90 04 46026 3.

The book is the latest work of Mirosława Hanusiewicz-Lavallee, a literature historian affiliated with the Catholic University of Lublin (Poland), currently in charge of the research project "Jesuit Translation Culture in Poland-Lithuania". Despite relying on a monograph published in Polish in 2017,¹ Hanusiewicz-Lavallee's *The Call of Albion* is a thoroughly revised work since it not only provides ad-

1 Mirosława Hanusiewicz-Lavallee. *W stronę Albionu. Studia z dziejów polsko-brytyjskich związków literackich w dobie wczesnowożytnej*. Lublin: Wydawnictwo KUL, 2017.

ditional information about the Polish-Lithuanian cultural milieu to the English-speaking readers but also content - and even interpretation-wise differs from the previous publication.

Although Polish-British cultural relations have recently become an object of scholarly interest, most research has focused on the second half of the eighteenth century, when Anglomania spread across Poland-Lithuania.² In such a context, Hanusiewicz-Lavallee's monograph fills a glaring historiographical gap by investigating the Polish-British cultural exchange before the Enlightenment. In particular, the author focuses on the reception of literature from England, Wales and Scotland in Poland-Lithuania. Jesuits played a crucial role in this process.

The author limits the scope of her research to the Renaissance and Baroque (which, in Poland-Lithuania, lasted until the mid-eighteenth century). During most of the early modern period, religious conflicts and the long-lasting humanistic tradition fuelled Polish interest in England and Scotland. Later, Anglomania was driven rather by the economic and political achievements of the expanding British Empire. Another reason for the chosen timeframe is that during the Renaissance and Baroque, translatory work aimed more at bringing the text closer to the reader than the opposite, as it would become during the Enlightenment.

Hanusiewicz-Lavallee mainly focuses on literary texts, particularly translations, which she situates within a broader intertextual framework. This approach differs from most former literature historians, who have often neglected translations as seemingly contradicting the originality of national literature. Even more than authors, translators are the heroes of this book, thanks to their constant and often underrated work of imitation, adaptation, and transposition. Besides the analyzed literary texts, the author exploits other sources, like private correspondence, to reconstruct the relationship between writers, patrons, and publishers. In this context, Jesuits appear not only as writers but also as organizers of cultural life.

The first chapter deals with Cyprian Bazylik's translation of John Foxe's *Rerum in ecclesia gestarum commentarii*. Chapter two analyses the reception of English Catholic writings in sixteenth-century Poland-Lithuania. Chapters three to five shift from religious to humanist literature, each focusing on three authors: George Buchanan, John Barclay and John Owen. Chapters six and seven move back to reli-

2 Richard Butterwick. *Poland's Last King and English Culture: Stanisław August Poniatowski, 1732-1798*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

gious literature in the eighteenth century, respectively presenting the eighteenth-century adaptations of Nicolas Sander's *De origine ac progressu schismatis Anglicani* and the Polish translation of John Bunyan's *The Pilgrim's Progress*.

From the point of view of Jesuit studies, the second and sixth chapters are the most relevant parts. However, due to their pedagogic activity, Jesuits also played a crucial role in the reception of English humanism. In chapter two, Hanusiewicz-Lavallee reconstructs the circle of Stanisław Hosius, bishop of Varmia, who not only established the first Polish Jesuit college in Braniewo but also was an advocate of English Catholics and a protector of Nicolas Sanders. Sander's posthumously published *De origine ac progressu schismatis Anglicani* served as one of the main sources of Piotr Skarga's *Żywoty świętych*, along with the writings of other English Catholic (and often Jesuit) emigres. Skarga supplemented subsequent editions of his hagiographies published during his lifetime with new material, stretching to the beginning of James I's reign. According to Skarga's political agenda, images of English martyrdom suggested that Polish Catholics would face persecution if Protestants overtook power. Latin writings by English authors were also fundamental in controversial theology, particularly Thomas Stapleton's *Promptuarium* and Edmond Campion's *Rationes decem*, with the latter even being translated by Skarga.

Buchanan was a problematic figure for the Jesuits. Poszakowski even dubbed him as an atheist. Before becoming a close associate of the Scottish Reformer John Knox, Buchanan had much in common with the first Jesuits. His poetry originated from Christian humanism under Erasmian influence. Moreover, the Scottish poet resided in Paris just as a bunch of companions gathered around Inigo Loyola. Later, he taught in Coimbra, where he became the object of the unwanted attention of the Portuguese Jesuit-led Inquisition and a Jesuit college would soon be founded. In Poland, Buchanan was well known for his literary work rather than his historical and political treatises, which earned him the opinion of a Monarchomach. Buchanan's paraphrase of the Psalm reached a cross-confessional audience and inspired among others Jan Kochanowski, the most famous Polish poet of the sixteenth century. Kochanowski's *Psalterz Dawidów* was largely present in Jesuit libraries.

John Barclay also had Jesuit connections. His father William had taught law at the Jesuit college in Pont-à-Mousson before falling into conflict with his employers over political matters. As a supporter of

absolutism, William polemized with Bellarmine's claim for papal superiority over secular monarchs. For this reason, John Barclay, who shared his father's political views, could have been unpalatable in Poland-Lithuania. Nevertheless, among John's writings, his *Paraenesis ad sectarios* was translated into Polish by Łukasz Górnicki's Jr. The work, written during the author's stay at James I's court, was a calm and balanced exposition of Catholic doctrine. For this reason, it must have appealed to the dedicatee, the Vilnius bishop Eustachy Wołłowicz, who, despite being a convert from Orthodoxy and a former pupil of the Jesuits, maintained a friendly relationship with Lithuanian Calvinists. Closely connected to the Jesuits was also Łukasz Opaliński, the defender of Poland's reputation against the slanders contained in Barclay's *Icon animorum*. Against the Scotsman's allegations, Opaliński argued that Poland had introjected the classical heritage and accused his adversary of being a fatuous courtier in an impressive display of literary proficiency.

Compared to Buchanan and Barclay, the reception of John Owen's Latin epigrams in Jesuit circles was even more pervasive. Despite his apostasy, Owen found many imitators among Polish Jesuits (Andrzej Obrębski, Wojciech Ines). The fortune of the Welsh epigrammatist as a school author lasted well into the eighteenth century, as shown by its later translations into Polish. Unlike Martial, Owen particularly fit the Jesuits for his strong moralistic tone and the absence of obscenities. His epigrams helped to spice up conversation and provided leisure during study breaks.

Chapter six moves back to religious issues, focusing on two eighteenth-century translations of Sander's *De origine ac progressu schismatis Anglicani*, both published in 1748, one anonymously from the Jesuit printing press in Sandomierz, and the other (in fact a compilation of various sources) by the Lithuanian Jesuit Jan Poszakowski in Warsaw. Both works combined historical narrative with religious polemics and appeared after history was introduced as an autonomous subject into Jesuit schools. In this regard, Hanusiewicz-Lavallee reinterprets Poszakowski's work compared to her previous book, where she considered the Lithuanian Jesuit a "belated martyrologist", devoting him the final part of the chapter about Catholic apologists. At the same time, Poszakowski's work had other aims besides the pedagogic one. After the Toruń Tumult (1724), the issue of Polish-Lithuanian religious dissenters (*dysydenci*) became increasingly internationalized, with Prussia and Russia exploiting it to put pressure on the Commonwealth. In such a context, Hanusiewicz-

Lavallee convincingly explains why Poszakowski decided to print his history of the English schism in Warsaw instead of Vilnius. His work was thus probably intended to strengthen the catholic stance and influence public debate. The author also emphasizes Poszakowski's connections with the Radziwiłł family. One may proceed further in concluding about the importance of the court milieu to Poszakowski's communication strategy. Controversies with fictional adversaries may not have been "bookish" at all (306) given to role of magnate courts as channels of cultural transfer. Despite the strong Jesuit influence over the Radziwiłłs, Poszakowski's controversies with atheists and deists may be seen as a pre-emptive strike against the impious ideas that might have set foot among aristocrats.

Regarding the sixth chapter, I would have a few additional remarks. The author's statement that in Sandomierz history was introduced already in 1709 as an autonomous teaching subject along with German and French (295) is not confirmed by the quoted sources. Only about thirty years later history became a subject distinct from rhetoric (although both would be usually taught by the same professor). A few additional sources allow us to confirm some of Hanusiewicz-Lavallee's hypotheses. For instance, the *catalogi breves* support the attribution of the *Historyja o schizmie* printed in Sandomierz to Marcin Laskowski.³ According to this source, between 1744 and 1747, Laskowski was the rhetoric professor and the author of the college chronicle (*scriptor historiarum*). Although he must not have necessarily been Sanders' translator, he could have well compiled historical narratives for his students. Library catalogues are another valuable primary source, shedding light on the translator's workshop. Hanusiewicz-Lavallee speculates that the Sandomierz translation of Sander's book relied on the 1585 *editio princeps* instead of later augmented editions since this was the only one available to Laskowski. However, the library of the Sandomierz College possessed a copy printed in Oliwa in 1690.⁴ The catalogue of the Nieśwież castle library, compiled in the early 1750s, provides clues to Poszakowski's historical erudition as we know from his biographer Jan Daniel Janocki that the Lithuanian Jesuits had access to the Radziwiłł private library. Its book collection included a French

3 ARSI, Pol. 46, *Catalogus personarum et officiorum Provinciae Polonae Societatis Jesu ex anno 1744 in annum 1745*, col. XXII; *ibid.*, *Catalogus personarum et officiorum Provinciae Polonae Societatis Jesu ex anno 1745 in annum 1746*, col. XXIII; *ibid.*, *Catalogus personarum et officiorum Provinciae Polonae Societatis Jesu ex anno 1746 in annum 1747*, col. XXIV.

4 Archiwum Główne Akt Dawnych, Tzw. Metryka Litewska, 131, fol. 67v.

edition of Gilbert Burnet's *History of the Reformation of the Church of England*, printed in Amsterdam in 1687, which Poszakowski certainly used.⁵ The chapter's intertextual approach could be enriched by the comparative analysis of other Jesuit martyrological writings like Wojciech Wijuk Kojalowicz's *Pamiętka krótka braciey koadiutorow* (Wilno 1673) and Jan Poszakowski's *Kalendarz jezuicki większy* (Wilno 1740), both featuring numerous Jesuits from the British Isles.

These suggestions for further research do not affect the overall evaluation of the book, which remains an excellent scholarly work. *The Call of Albion* offers a deep insight into the meanders of early modern cultural exchange and the role of Jesuits as cultural mediators. In particular, it shows how this phenomenon changed between the sixteenth and the mid-eighteenth century when the French language superseded Latin as the medium of knowledge transfer. By restoring translators to the place they owe in the history of literature, Hanusiewicz-Lavallee answers a wider research question that underpins the entire book. She depicts the rise of Polish national consciousness through the representation of the other and the Jesuit contribution to this process.

Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznań

Andrea Mariani

Ulrich L. Lehner, *Inszenierte Keuschheit. Sexualdelikte in der Gesellschaft Jesu im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert*, Berlin: De Gruyter, 2024. 306pp. €59,95. ISBN 978-3-11-131098-5.

"Inszenierte Keuschheit" ("Staged Chastity")⁶ is the main title of this volume dealing with the subject of sexual offences in the early-modern Society of Jesus. It considers documents about confirmed and imputed sexual offences, as well as the subject's representation, reception, and meaning inside and outside the Society. The study is new, not only for histories of the German-speaking Jesuit provinces, but also more broadly for germanophone church history.

The volume focuses on the Province of *Germania superior*, with a series of more or less lengthy Jesuit dismissal files at Bayerisches Hauptstaatsarchiv (BayHStA), which form the main extant sources

5 Archiwum Główne Akt Dawnych, Archiwum Radziwiłłów, Rękopisy Biblioteczne, 8 (I-6; N 866), 15.

6 All translations into English are by the reviewer.

on the subject in the region and the main basis of the study (2), augmented by further sources located in Munich and other, mostly European institutions (263–69). In the volume, the author uses the term *staging*—recalling early modern Jesuit plays—as a heuristic technique to assess Jesuit chastity enacted, but not practised. The term’s use, furthermore, recalls the typical strategy in this period to postpone news about members’ sexual deviance until after dismissal from the Society of Jesus, with the aim, as the author writes, “to uphold the staging of chastity” (66).

The study is presented in nine chapters: After an introduction (1–8), a priest’s “reputation” (9–30) and the term “sexual offence” (31–37) are discussed; this is followed by the “dimissio” (“dismissal”) of Jesuits (38–67); sexual deviance of Jesuits as a literary leitmotif (68–101), and “sexuality in the Society of Jesus” (102–203). The seventh chapter deals with a case study, “Abuse in Mexico and Mainz: The case of Maximilian Gill” (204–29); the following chapter (with only a few Jesuits mentioned) focuses on the procedure of “final dismissal” (230–57). The last chapter considers “prospects for the future” (258–59), with reflections about the present time. The nine chapters end rather precipitately: a summary drawing together conclusions from the vast material would have been helpful.

Methodically speaking, the author recognises the difficulty “with which historians are faced” when conducting research on sexual offences in early modern times. Court procedures and societal expectations regarding sexual crime were very different from present-day conceptions and definitions (31). On the one hand, many offences understood as crimes—both at the time and today—no doubt remained unreported (2) and therefore are frustratingly (for the historian) absent from archival records; on the other hand, as the author notes, one issue among many with which historians must grapple is that in some cases slander (172f.) may have been used as revenge in making unfounded accusations.

Despite this recognition of the inherent complexities in early-modern accounts and records concerning sexual offences, several problematic matters arise. One is historiographical: in the earlier study by Markus Friedrich, *The Jesuits: A History*, three pages of the large-scale survey are dedicated to the subject, providing names of Jesuits and related sources that are missing in Lehner’s study, despite Lehner referring to the relevant section of the work (cf. 5f. [p. 6, n. 20]): the examples provided in Friedrich’s survey of this topic

would have provided useful context for Lehner's discussion.⁷ Another problematic feature of the volume under consideration is the Latin transcriptions and translations into German of the original documents about alleged or real Jesuit sexual misdemeanours and their interpretation by the author. The remainder of the review will focus on this aspect of the work. While taking into consideration the volume as a whole, in which such problems have been identified throughout, the following remarks present a small selection of such cases.

As a starting-point for the study as a whole, the author draws on an anti-Jesuit booklet, published in 1815 by Karl Heinrich von Lang (1764–1835), the director of the then Munich Allgemeines Reichsarchiv (est. 1799) from 1810 to 1815: *Reverendi in Christo Patris Jacobi Marelli S. J. amores. E scriniis Provinciae superioris Germaniae Monachii nuper apertis brevi libello expositi*. Munich: [n.p.] 1815, a revised edition of the same year. The work, written by a Protestant, was part of a broader European current against the newly-restored Society of Jesus (1814): its centrepiece was the life of Jacobus Marell [SJ] (1649–1727), who, over a century earlier, had attracted infamy to himself and the Society of Jesus for his sexual misconduct, and was eventually dismissed; a further thirty-three accounts of Jesuit sexual offences were included in Lang's book.

One of these is discussed in *Inszenierte Keuschheit*: despite citing the relevant original letter from the Bayerisches Hauptstaatsarchiv, the author adopts errors from Lang's account, briefly stating that Franciscus Bauman SJ (1644–1717) "forcibly touched many girls [*zahlreichen Mädchen*] in 1699" (33).⁸ The complete letter on this subject reads otherwise. Dated Oelenberg, 18 January 1699, it deals with adult *devotissae* (dévotées), French Ursulines, professed semireligious women under the Jesuits' spiritual guidance. In Reiningen (Alsace), situated near the Oelenberg Jesuit residence, Bauman and other Jesuits tried to establish a convent for the Ursulines (who had arrived in Freiburg im Breisgau in 1696), in addition to ministering to the parish of Reiningen from 1687. Bauman was superior of the Oelenberg Jesuit residence in 1696/97, moving back to the college in Freiburg in 1697.⁹ The letter, written by Bauman's successor as superior

7 Cf. Markus Friedrich. *The Jesuits: A History*. Translated by John Noël Dillon. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2022, 123–25.

8 Cf. Lang, *Amores*, 34f. no. 26; Munich. Bayerisches Hauptstaatsarchiv (BayHStA), *Jesuitica* 360, ff. 2rv.

9 Cf. Rome. Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (ARSI), *Germ. Sup.* 48, ff. 159v, 175v, 401v, 429v, 465v, 497v.

from 1697, Jacobus Rosenthaler SJ (1652–1725),¹⁰ informed provincial Martin Müller SJ (1637–1704) about Bauman's inappropriate contacts with the female community, which were still being continued clandestinely via slips of paper and messengers, subsequently corroborated by a devoté, whom Bauman "seemed to yearn for most".¹¹

Rosenthaler's account is detailed: although Bauman had forbidden the woman in question during a visit of hers to Freiburg to reveal their connection to his confreres, she sighed for Bauman's physical presence when becoming ill "in these days",¹² i.e. after the summer of 1698, embarrassing bystanders with her words. Rosenthaler explains: "Once",¹³ while being ill for eight days in Reiningen—probably in 1696/97—, the woman had been cared for by Bauman, who sat next to her for entire days, playing doctor, touching her unclothed chest, breasts, abdomen and below the waist. The letter recounted that "another"¹⁴ devoté—probably questioned by Rosenthaler—had been touched by Bauman several times and had to endure his gazes and other things, in turn confessing to Bauman himself, who absolved her in the confessional (on p. 33 falsely attributed to the "many girls", with the Latin original reading "ab ipso passam" and not "ab ipso passa"). "These and other things", i.e. rumours, Rosenthaler recounts, were "spread even by the small girls",¹⁵ i.e. the Ursulines' underage female pupils. Thus, the full letter detailing Bauman's misconduct does not mention abuse of girls, except in relation to rumours spread by them.¹⁶

While Lehner is well aware that Bauman had an older namesake, citing the latter's obituary (pp. 33f. note 125),¹⁷ some confusion between them emerges in the book: while the younger Bauman never was "professor at the Munich Wilhelmsgymnasium between 1672 and 1676" (33 n123), his namesake Franciscus Bauman SJ (1637–95) did teach in that city during that period.¹⁸ The extant sources further

10 Cf. ARSI, *Germ. Sup.* 48, ff. 466r, 498r.

11 BayHStA, *Jesuitica* 360, f. 2r: "quam vel maxime deperire videbatur".

12 Ibid.: "his diebus".

13 Ibid.: "aliquando".

14 Ibid.: "Alia".

15 Ibid.: "Haec et plura alia ab ipsismet parvulis puellis sparguntur".

16 On the subject of rumours about Jesuit misconduct against girls, Lehner mentions a rumour concerning underage pupils in Rottenburg in 1712 (182).

17 The obituary is preserved at Munich. Archiv der Zentraleuropäischen Provinz der Jesuiten (APECESJ), Abt. 41 - 25, pp. 80f. (not ff. 80–82, as Lehner mistakenly cites).

18 The younger Bauman studied theology in Ingolstadt between 1671 and 1675 (ARSI, *Germ. Sup.* 47, ff. 469r, 489r). Further reference for the older Bauman's teaching in Munich at ARSI, *Germ. Sup.* 47, ff. 473v, 494v, 518r; *Germ. Sup.* 47c

reveal that the younger Bauman was not sent “to Egypt” as a missionary either, therefore the posting—a mistake adopted from older secondary literature—could not function as “a penance” for his sexual transgressions, as Lehner asserts (33).¹⁹

A different case study presented in *Inszenierte Keuschheit* is drawn from the Province of *Rhenania superior*. It is based on consultations held in Mainz on 17 October 1721 about an anonymized father “M. H.,” whom Lehner identifies as Matthias Hönicke SJ (1664–1724).²⁰ Here, Lehner describes how Hönicke was “accused” of soliciting two persons, and “punished” for it (34). The sources confirm that the accusation took place, but they do not mention a punishment or charge of guilt. The source states: “that upon receiving the document with information regarding the individual charges, he [Hönicke] shall be questioned about them so that it will be possible to decide then what has to be done” (“quod accepta de singulis delationis punctis informatione de singulis interrogandus sit, ut statui deinde possit, quid agendum”).²¹ Unfortunately, the extant sources do not reveal the outcome of the investigation, let alone whether the Jesuit in question was found guilty or “punished”, as the author states.

In a further case drawn from the 1728 Mainz provincial consultations, Lehner states that “a Jesuit had tried to seduce several women” in the confessional; he quotes the consultations as identifying the transgression “a dangerous abuse” (*abusus periculosus*)” (34). The full text dating from 21 May 1728 does not identify a single Jesuit, but makes a general point about the risks associated with Jesuit ministries to women, noting: “that it is observed that *the dangerous abuse* creeps in, that some of Ours [Jesuits] detain women too long in the confessional or at the door, and imprudently visit them in their homes; for which a remedy should be undertaken” (italics my emphasis) (“quod observatur irrepere abusus periculosus, ut aliqui nostri nimis diu detineant faeminas in confessionali vel ad januam, facile etiam easdem in aedibus suis inuisant; quid remedii

(1673/74) is a photographic reproduction of BayHStA, *Jesuitica* 417 (1673/74).

19 Bauman was relocated from the Jesuit college of Freiburg to the Oettingen house of probation in 1699, from there to the Solothurn Jesuit residence in 1701, and finally to the Munich Jesuit college in 1706 (ARSI, *Germ. Sup.* 49, ff. 17r, 70r, 201v; last mentioned alive in Munich in 1717: *Germ. Sup.* 33, p. 99 no. 2). Cf. Libois, Charles SJ. “Les Jésuites de l’ancienne Compagnie en Egypte”. *AHSI* 51 (1982): 161–89, here 164.

20 Hönicke had been one of four “Consultores Collegiorum” in the Heidelberg Jesuit residence from 1712 to 1718 and from 1719 to 1721, see ARSI, *Germ. Sup.* 26 II, ff. 468v, 478v, 482v, 489r, 495r, 499r, 504v, 512v, 517r, 535r, 547v.

21 APECESJ, Abt. 40 - 2,7, p. 181 (no. 2).

opponendum").²² About the "Jesuit" in question, Lehner states: "The opportunity was offered to him to mend his ways, and the superiors were admonished to observe him carefully" (34). Instead, the *Responsum* preserved with the Mainz provincial consultations, quoted above, does not refer to any particular Jesuit: "The superiors shall be advised to take special care for the correction of this abuse; but the matter should be first privately raised, then, if they do not mend their ways, they shall be admonished publicly" ("Moneantur superiores, ut speciali cura in emendationem hujus abusus invigilent; rei autem privatim primum, tum etiam, si non emendarint, publice moneantur"). In this provincial consultation, sexual transgression is not mentioned in relation to any specific case; instead the report points to concern that the precautionary rules were being neglected by some fathers, thus increasing the risk of abuse.²³

Although the volume offers, at first glance, a spectrum of real sexual offences, the brief selection of examples provided here suggests that the complex sources under consideration required more extensive analysis and accurate treatment in the development of the book's main frame and argument, supplemented by further research where necessary. Future editions of this work would be well served by a thorough revision of the sources and their interpretation. Given the sensitivity of the subject—then and now—and at the same time the importance of facing this difficult topic, and of bringing it to light, paying careful attention to the issues highlighted in this review is all the more essential to the crucial and timely task of breaking new ground in this research area.

Julius-Maximilians-Universität Würzburg

Frank Sobiech

Ionuț-Alexandru Tudorie and Daniel Benga, eds, *The Manifold Faces of the East: Western Images of the Post-Byzantine Christian World in the Age of Reformation*, Paderborn: Brill- Schöningh, 2024. xvi+271pp. €116,90. 978-3-506-79471-0.

²² Ibid., p. 273 (no. 3).

²³ During the provincial's visitations the priests might also be admonished to obey the rule in this regard (cf. *ibid.*), i.e. the "Tertia instructio pro confessariis Societatis" of the 7th General Congregation, see *Institutum Societatis Iesu*, vol. 3, Florence: Ex Typographia a SS. Conceptione, 1893, 346, instructio III. Pro confessariis Societatis, no. 3: "si in confessionalis longa protrahantur colloquia", and p. 735 ll. 15–18: "Visitatio Provinciae".

In recent years, scholars have increasingly begun to take a more nuanced approach to exploring the Age of Reformations. In particular, by moving beyond the Catholic-Protestant binary, we have seen a proliferation of studies that show how previous scholarship often ignored the place of religious minorities such as Jews within the Age of Reformations, as well as how Christendom's fracturing shaped relationships, views, and representations of Islam. There have even been studies of the globalization of the Age of Reformations and the world's various Indigenous communities' confrontation with the emergence of European imperialism, of which evangelization was a central element. In a similar vein, as numerous scholars have argued, the Age of Reformations must also include examinations of Western Europe's relationship with Eastern Christianity.

Contributing to this discussion in interesting ways is this fine collection of essays that links early modern travel studies—a dynamic field in its own right—to the study of pan-Christian relations across the Mediterranean. *The Manifold Faces of the East*, which stems from a conference held in Bucharest, Romania, in 2019, brings together seven scholars who explore “the way in which images of Eastern Christianity are constructed in the diaries and travel descriptions of Western voyagers to the Ottoman Empire, during the second half of the sixteenth century and the beginning of the seventeenth century” (vii) to interrogate the place of Eastern Christians in the Age of Reformations. Exploring travel narratives in particular—as opposed to missionary letters, theological treatises, or epistolary exchange between clerics, as is often typical—this volume shows that questions of culture, theology, orthopraxy, and the like are as much questions for religious elites as they were everyday concerns. By linking questions of religion to history of mentalities, cross-cultural interaction, and travel, in other words, this volume underscores that relations between the various Christian sects across the Mediterranean permeated all levels of society.

In particular, by investigating “religion and the investigation of the other's beliefs as identity markers” (viii) via travel narratives, this volume allows us to see how religious identity, mobility, and cross-cultural interaction were in dialogue, resulting in a recursive dialectic that shaped both Western and Eastern Christianity, perhaps even making such a dichotomy less firm than we have often considered it. Likewise, the authors interrogate how these past views shaped modern Western perceptions of Eastern Christians, and the

role that such perceptions continue to play in Mediterranean geopolitics. This is an especially crucial intervention, as Eastern Christians often get lost in discussions about the current geopolitics of the Mediterranean and the quite damaging Orientalist discourse of “clash of civilizations,” despite sizable Christian populations not only in Southeast Europe, but also across the Arab world.

The volume’s focus on travel narratives written between 1547 and 1585 by Catholic and Protestant German, Flemish, French, and Italian writers from a variety of backgrounds provides a wider angle by which we can evaluate Western European views of Eastern Christianity. The time frame is especially important, as it covers the periods of the Council of Trent, the establishment of the Protestant confessions of Europe, political tensions and religious wars, and the resulting uneasy rapprochement after the 1555 Peace at Augsburg. Likewise, the volume covers both the Ottomans’ European realms as well as Southwest Asia and North Africa. And by moving across national and confessional boundaries as well as including scholars, humanists, theologians, and diplomats, the essays in this volume critique the totalizing view of “Western Christianity” or *just* Catholic or Protestant, by pursuing more capacious explorations of Western Christian *views* of Eastern Christianity that are deeply varied.

For example, the first chapter, written by Sebastian-Lauren iu Nazârû, examines Pierre Belon, naturalist and friend of French Ambassador to the Ottoman Empire, who spent 1547–48 traveling through realm of Sultan Suleiman; according to Nazârû, Belon admired Eastern Christians and even praised Ottomans for how they treated their religious minorities. By contrast, in Chapter Three, volume co-editor Daniel Benga illustrates how Stephan Gerlach and Salomon Schweigger, who served as chaplains at the German embassy in Constantinople in 1573–81, were directly concerned with Catholic-Protestant theological debates, which colored their view of Eastern Christians; in particular, they criticized Greek Orthodox practices that approximated Catholicism as “superstition” as a form of Protestant anti-Catholic polemic. In both cases, despite their different conclusions and goals, these travelers had intimate knowledge of the communities they observed. This shows, again, that travel, contact, and exchange were shaped by the worldviews of those who interacted with one another. In turn, as the editors write, the articles “conserve in their unity the character of a mosaic composing a diverse and complex perspective on the life of Eastern Christians in the territories and timeframe under scrutiny” (xv).

The one element where I found myself somewhat confused as a reader, however, was the use of the phrase “post-Byzantine” Christian world as opposed to Ottoman Christian world or, perhaps more neutrally, Eastern Christian world. First, many of the Christian communities explored in this volume had not been under effective Byzantine imperial rule for centuries; for example, Egypt, Lebanon, Palestine, and Syria had been outside of the Byzantine Empire since the seventh century. Second, many of the Christian communities of the Eastern Mediterranean were not in communion with the Greek Orthodox (e.g., Armenians, Assyrians, Copts, Jacobites, Maronites). While the essays in this volume do recognize these distinctions, the use of the phrase “post-Byzantine” occludes the nuance of Eastern Christianity and intimates that Greek Orthodoxy is its default form with everything deriving or deviating from that.

Despite this, on the whole, the volume underscores the complexities of the Age of Reformations and reminds us of the place of the Ottoman Empire and its Christian communities within it. Ranging from studies on the Ottoman treatment of Christians to sectarian polemic to festivals and more, this volume illuminates much about the place of Christians in the Ottoman Empire as well as how Western Christians perceived them. Likewise, for readers of this journal, several essays place the Jesuits into this conversation and show how their missions to the Ottoman Empire operated within this framework. This volume is an essential contribution for readers interested in moving beyond the Catholic-Protestant binary in the Age of Reformations, studying the intersection of religion and travel, and unpacking the global nature of early modern religious life.

Western Carolina University

Robert Clines